

# DEBATE UNIT 5 & 6: MEDIEVAL EUROPE & EMERGENCE OF NEW EMPIRES

## THURSDAY (MARCH 3<sup>RD</sup>) & FRIDAY (MARCH 4<sup>TH</sup>)

### DEBATE STRUCTURE

- Moderator introduces the debate
- Construction (present your argument)
  - Affirmative One- 1:30
  - Negative One- 1:30
  - Affirmative Two- 1:30
  - Negative Two- 1:30
- Rebuttal (Refuting your opponent)
  - Affirmative One- 0:45
  - Negative One- 0:45
  - Affirmative Two- 0:45
  - Negative Two- 0:45
- Moderator concludes debate

### DEBATE GROUPS

1. Do the Middle Ages deserve to be called the Dark Ages?
  - a. Affirmative: Philip Ruszczyk, Mathew Maldonado, Ashley Tully
  - b. Negative: Chayna Otero, Gianna Rodriguez, Arben Tejovic
  - c. Moderator: Jessica Guillen, Madelynn Torress, Vail Gutierrez\*

**Research Suggestions:** The term “Dark Ages” was once commonly used to describe the Middle Ages, but has recently become unpopular, as many historians feel it unfairly ignores many of the positive aspects of the Medieval period. Your task is to examine the events and trends of the Middle Ages and determine whether or not this age should be considered truly dark. Topics to consider may include but are not limited to: Fall of Rome; Charlemagne; Vikings; Feudalism; Manor System; European Knights; Serfdom; the Catholic Church; Monks; the East-West Schism; the Crusades; the Commercial Revolution; the Guild System; the Late Medieval Revival; Medieval Universities; the Mongol Invasions; the Black Death; the Great Schism; the Hundred Years War.

2. Were the motivations for the Crusades more secular than religious?
  - a. Affirmative: Max Robertazzi, Katherine Ferguson
  - b. Negative: Brian Corcho, Mathew Merlo
  - c. Moderator: Alan Yang, Athena Napigkit

**Research Suggestions:** The Crusades are commonly imagined as religious wars, but while religion certainly played a major role, the reality was far more complicated. The Crusades were also motivated by a number of social, political, economic, and cultural factors. Your task is to examine what events and what circumstances led to the launching of the Crusades, and determine whether or not religion was the primary motivator. You are not limited only the causes of the First Crusade; you may explore the causes of all of them, even the less famous ones. Topics to consider may include but are not limited to: the Seljuk Turks; the Byzantine Empire; Emperor Alexius I, Pope Urban and his 1095 speech at Clermont; European Knights; the Power of the Papacy; the East-West Schism; cultural and socio-economic differences between Western Europe, the Byzantine Empire, and the Muslim Middle East; treatment of Jews; the Crusader States, and the experience of Western Europeans living in them; the Fourth Crusade; other Crusades.

3. Should the Crusades be considered a success?
  - a. Affirmative: Emily Pacheco, Riga Dorjee
  - b. Negative: Nayeem Chowdhury, Natalia Torres
  - c. Moderator: Piotr Bryla, Brenda Niños

**Research Suggestions:** While the original, official goals of the Crusades may not have been achieved, the Crusades brought many outcomes that could be described as successes. Your task is to examine the Crusades, from all perspectives, and the results they produced, in order to determine whether these wars were ultimately successful. Topics to consider may include but are not limited to: the religious and secular motivations for the Crusades; Pope Urban's speech; the violence and cruelty of the Crusades; the death toll; the Crusader States, and the experience of Western Europeans living in them; the Fourth Crusade; the Byzantine Empire and the Holy Land after the Crusades; Cultural Diffusion; Commercial Revolution; the Late Medieval Revival; the Renaissance.

4. Were the Mongol invasions more detrimental than beneficial?
  - a. Affirmative: Ross McGregor, Kamil Wojtowicz
  - b. Negative: William Moffat, Salome Vargas
  - c. Moderator: Kemely Baez, Janelli Nuñez

**Research Suggestions:** Most people think of the Mongols as violent barbarians. However, while the Mongols were terrifying conquerors, they also contributed heavily to the development, reorganization, and interconnection of the many lands they brought under their control, and laid the foundations for new empires that followed them. Your task is to examine the impact of the Mongol conquests on the world and determine whether they were more harmful or more helpful. Topics to consider may include but are not limited to: the motivations for conquest by Mongols; Genghis Khan; Mongol military technologies/techniques; Mongol invasion of Baghdad, destruction and death caused by Mongols; treatment of conquered peoples; Mongol style of rule; cultural diffusion; revival of trade; Yuan Dynasty; Ming Dynasty; Golden Horde; development of Russia; Timur; Mughals.

5. Were the Ottomans better rulers than the Mughals?
  - a. Affirmative: Daniel Makowski, Beyza Secilmis
  - b. Negative: Leiry Gomez, Nancy Du
  - c. Moderator: Jayden Fernandez, Jaedynn Torres

**Research Suggestions:** Both the Ottoman Empire and the Mughal Empire have long and varied legacies. They both rose to power with the help of gunpowder and left a lasting influence on the lands they ruled. Your task is to explore how well they ruled these lands, and by examining the policies and actions of their rulers and governments, determine which empire was superior overall in the way it ruled. Topics to consider may include but are not limited to: the origins of the Mughals and Ottomans; the role of gunpowder; Osman; Devsirme System; Janissaries; Mehmet the Conqueror; Ottoman conquest of Constantinople; Hagia Sophia; the Millet System; Suleiman the Magnificent; Babur; Akbar the Great; Sulh-i-Kul; Din-i-Ilahi; Sikhism; Shah Jahan; Taj Mahal; Aurangzeb; treatment of religious minorities.

## HOMWORK FOR NEXT CLASS

Begin your debate research tonight, going through all the class materials I have provided to you that relate to your topic, as well as searching for additional information online. **By Tuesday**, you are REQUIRED to have at least one printed source of outside research with you, as well as any class materials, so they can be used to research as a group. **By Wednesday**, you MUST have at least three talking point arguments that you will use for the debate, supported thoroughly with evidence, and with FULLY cited sources.